

ACCRA METROPOLITAN ASSEMBLY
WASTE MANAGEMENT DEPARTMENT



**PERFORMANCE REPORT
ON
SOLID WASTE CONTRACTORS**

**FORTH QUARTER
OCTOBER - DECEMBER 2023**

CONTRACT PERIOD (DECEMBER 2022 TO NOVEMBER 2027)

DECEMBER 2023

Table of Contents

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY.....	3
1.0 INTRODUCTION	4
2.0 PERFORMANCE INDICATORS	5
3.0 METHODOLOGY.....	6
4.0 PERFORMANCE RATING.....	8
5.0. DETAILED EVALUATION OF SERVICE PROVIDERS.....	9
5.1. ZOOLION GH. – Ablekuma South Sub Metro.....	9
5.2.2 KOBBI WASTE Waste – Ablekuma South Sub Metro	10
5.2.3 Meskworld Co Limited – Ashiedu Keteke Sub Metro	11
5.2.4 ASADU WASTE GH. Limited – Okai Koi South Sub Metro.....	12
5.2.5 J. Stanley Owusu and Co Limited	13
6.0 OUTCOME OF PERFORMANCE EVALUATION – JULY TO SEPTEMBER 2018.....	21
6.0 RECOMMENDATIONS	22
7.0 AMA/WMD CONCERNS	23
8.0 CONCERNS OF THE SERVICE PROVIDERS	24
9.0 CONCLUSION	25

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The performances of these service providers in their respective service zones were evaluated for the period of October 2023 to December 2023. Indicators used for the evaluation were derived from the Fee and Performance Based Solid Waste Collection Service Franchise Agreement signed between AMA and service providers including innovations, coverage, equipment holding, health and safety among others. Generally, performance of service providers for the period was unsatisfactory. Out of five (5) service providers, the highest score was **60.2 %** and the least was **36.2 %** which is unsatisfactory performance.

Of the estimated **77,960** households, only 15,204 has been registered representing 25 % and a total of 8562 bins has been distributed representing 11 % on assumption that distribution was on the basis of one bin per household.

1.0 INTRODUCTION

Accra Metropolitan Assembly entered into a franchise agreement with Solid Waste Service providers on the 4th August, 2016 for the provision of Fee and Performance based Solid Waste Collection Service. The SERVICES of the SERVICE PROVIDER under the agreement is subject to performance monitoring and evaluation. This report is an evaluation of the performance of all the contractors from first to fourth quarter of 2023.

The evaluation was done on the basis of Service zones (Lots) carved out for the Contractors.

There was a total of Five (5) Contract Lots within the (3) Sub metros.

Both the contractors and Assembly's obligations were considered as captured in the contract document. Waste generation in the Accra Metropolitan Assembly is currently **1,645 ton/day**, based on the three (3) sub metros only 2020 population plus an influx of 500,000 people at an estimated generation rate of 0.71kg per person per day.

2.0 PERFORMANCE INDICATORS

Indicators used for the performance evaluation were derived from the Fee and Performance Based Solid Waste Collection Service Franchise Agreement between respective service providers and the Accra Metropolitan Assembly (AMA) signed in August 2016. Key articles under “Obligations of SERVICE PROVIDER” used were but not limited to the following;

- 2.1 Register all premises in the service zone and maintain a register of all premises receiving service.
- 2.2 Supply ‘Standard solid waste bins (plastic or metallic)
- 2.3 Frequency of service
- 2.4 Maintenance of designated sanitary sites
- 2.13 Provision of PPEs at all times
- 2.21 Submission of monthly reports
- 2.23 Collaboration with relevant departments to ensure clean environment
- 2.24 Innovative activities to promote recycling
- 2.27 Service coverage
- 2.29 Innovations (recycling, integration of informal collectors etc.)
- 2.30 Innovation (collection of market waste)

3.0 METHODOLOGY

Data on household registration, bins supplied, equipment holding and tour schedules were collected from service providers using formats provided by the Waste Management Department for the performance evaluation process.

As part of the evaluation process, representatives of service providers requested to make a maximum of ten munities PowerPoint presentation to a panel made up of evaluation team of the Waste Management Department, representatives from the respective sub metro and the Metro Public Health Department.

Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) were derived from the Franchise Agreement between the Accra Metropolitan Assembly and service providers.

The assessment of the performance of the contractors was categorized into two sections; Capacity of Service Providers and Actual Service Delivery Performance

CAPACITY PERFORMANCE (weighted 30 marks)

CALCULATION OF HOUSEHOLDS REGISTERED (WEIGHTED 15 MARKS)

No. of Households registered $\times 100 = \text{Answer} \times \text{weighted marks (15\%)}$
Estimated Households in Service Area

CALCULATION OF BINS DISTRIBUTED (WEIGHTED 15 MARKS)

No. of Refuse Bins supplied $\times 100 = \text{Answer} \times \text{weighted marks (15\%)}$
Estimated Households Service Area

SERVICE DELIVERY PERFORMANCE (weighted 70 marks)

- 1) **Innovation and Recycling (maximum deduction is 10):** Service providers must be involved in waste reduction and recycling within their service zones and produce strategies for market and transport terminal sanitation as well as other specialized services.
- 2) **Collaboration with the WMD and MPH (maximum deduction is 10):** Marks were deducted taking into consideration service providers collaboration with the WMD and the MPH within the

respective service zones of contractors to improve services, support for public cleansing activities and cooperated social responsibility.

- 3) **Submission of Monthly Reports (maximum deduction is 5)** this keeps track on the service providers monthly operations within their respective service zones.
- 4) **Service Coverage (maximum deduction is 10):** This captures the number of houses registered and clients serviced within the service area.
- 5) **General Cleanliness/Indiscriminate Dumping (maximum deduction is 15):** this marks takes into consideration contractors who failed to act proactively to control indiscriminate dumping of waste in open spaces and drains within their, irregular service schedules (including communal containers) and general cleanliness of service zone.
- 6) **Capacity of Contractors Equipment holding (maximum deduction is 10):** this gives a clear indication of the contractor's equipment holding capacity and their ability to execute the assigned task respectively in the area of operation.
- 7) **Health and Safety (maximum deduction is 10):** this helps to keep and monitor the safeguards measure put in place to prevent minor accidents that are likely to occur.

4.0 PERFORMANCE RATING

The rating aims at quantifying the performance of the Contractors. The team agreed on a range of scores to be used in this assessment.

➤ Excellent Performance	-	<u>X>85%</u>
➤ Satisfactory Performance	-	<u>85%<X> 75%</u>
➤ Average Performance	-	<u>75%<X> 65%</u>
➤ Unsatisfactory Performance	-	<u>65%<X</u>

Where X is Performance

The pass mark of 65% may seem too high; however, one should imagine the impact of 25% (440 tons) uncollected refuse daily within the environment let alone the cumulative effect over time.

Please note estimated household size = 4.1

Estimated growth rate 2021 = 2.12%

5.0. DETAILED EVALUATION OF SERVICE PROVIDERS

5.1. ZOOLION GH. – Ablekuma South Sub Metro

- 1) **Innovation and Recycling (maximum deduction is 10):** During the period under review, no notable innovation was witnessed in the operations of the company. The company was required per the Franchise Agreement with the AMA to collect at least **12 tonnes** of recyclable plastics separately by the end of the sixth year of the franchise ie. **end of December, 2023**. Deductions = 7
- 2) **Collaboration with the WMD and MPHD (maximum deduction is 10):** There were some collaborations with departments of the AMA especially in the area of enforcement. During the period, support for Ablekuma South in public cleansing activities such as clean up campaigns was inadequate. Deduction = 4
- 3) **Submission of Monthly Reports (maximum deduction is 5):** The service provider does not submit monthly reports. Deductions = 5
- 4) **Service Coverage (maximum deduction is 10):** Collection service coverage within the Ablekuma South Sub Metro was not complete during the fourth quarter 2023. Many households in communities such as Mamprobi and Korle – Gonno have not been registered for house to house refuse collection. Deduction = 4
- 5) **General Cleanliness/Indiscriminate Dumping (maximum deduction is 15):** Low service coverage consequently resulted in upsurge in indiscriminate disposal of waste at the beaches and open spaces. Households that are quite far from communal container sites and do not benefit from house to house services have no option that to dispose of waste indiscriminately. Deductions = 8
- 6) **Capacity of Contractors Equipment holding (maximum deduction is 10):** The quantity of collection vehicles provided was not adequate. Deductions = 2
- 7) **Health and Safety (maximum deduction is 10):** The company provided adequate PPE for waste collection crew. However, usage was not strictly enforced. Deduction made is 2.

5.2.2 KOBBY WASTE – Ablekuma South Sub Metro

- 1) **Innovation and Recycling (maximum deduction is 10):** During the period under review, no notable innovation was witnessed in the operations of the company. The company was required per the Franchise Agreement with the AMA to collect at least 12 tonnes of recyclable plastics separately by the end of the sixth year of the franchise ie. end of December, 2023. Deductions = **4**.
- 2) **Collaboration with the WMD and MPH (maximum deduction is 10):** Some collaboration was witnessed in the area of enforcement and public cleansing. The service provided did not provide any support to the **Ashiedu Keteke Sub** Metro during clean up exercises. Deduction = **6**.
- 3) **Submission of Monthly Reports (maximum deduction is 5):** The service provider did not submit monthly reports. Deduction = **5**.
- 4) **Service Coverage (maximum deduction is 10):** About 15% of percentage of households in Zoti and Sepei, did not receive service from the service provider. The service provider was not visible in the service zone, creating avenues for junkies and other informal collectors to operate. Deduction = **4**.
- 5) **General Cleanliness/Indiscriminate Dumping (maximum deduction is 15):** Most streets and open spaces are somewhat clean apart from Sepei and parts of Korle -bu. Deduction = **5**.
- 6) **Capacity of Contractors Equipment holding (maximum deduction is 10):** The quantity of collection vehicles available was not adequate. Deductions = **4**
- 7) **Health and Safety (maximum deduction is 10):** The company provided adequate PPE for waste collection crew. However, usage was not strictly enforced. Deduction made is **5**

5.2.3 Meskworld Co Limited – Ashiedu Keteke Sub Metro

- 1) **Innovation and Recycling (maximum deduction is 10):** During the period under review, no notable innovation was witnessed in the operations of the company. The company was required per the Franchise Agreement with the AMA to collect at least 12 tonnes of recyclable plastics separately by the end of the sixth year of the franchise ie. end of December, 2023. Deductions = 5.
- 2) **Collaboration with the WMD and MPHD (maximum deduction is 10):** The collaboration with the service provider improved and relevant departments of the AMA. Deduction = 2.
- 3) **Submission of Monthly Reports (maximum deduction is 5):** The service provider does not submit monthly reports. Deductions = 5.
- 4) **Service Coverage (maximum deduction is 10):** Collection services within the Messrs. Meskworld's service zone within Sub Metro was very low. Service was limited to Makola and its environs and some commercial clients. Deductions = 3.
- 5) **General Cleanliness/Indiscriminate Dumping (maximum deduction is 15):** There was constant accumulation of refuse in the service zone due to low coverage and absence of strategy to service markets within. Deductions = 4.
- 6) **Capacity of Contractors/ Equipment holding (maximum deduction is 10):** The service provider capacity to efficiently render services in the assigned service zone improved. Deduction = 3.
- 7) **Health and Safety (maximum deduction is 10):** PPEs provided for collection crew were woefully inadequate. Deduction = 5.

5.2.4 ASADU WASTE OKAI KOI SOUTH Sub Metro

- 8) **Innovation and Recycling (maximum deduction is 10):** During the period under review, no notable innovation was witnessed in the operations of the company. The company was required per the Franchise Agreement with the AMA to collect at least 12 tonnes of recyclable plastics separately by the end of the sixth year of the franchise ie. end of December, 2023. Deductions = 7.
- 9) **Collaboration with the WMD and MPH (maximum deduction is 10):** Some collaboration was witnessed in the area of enforcement and public cleansing. The service provided did not provide any support to the Ashiedu Keteke Sub Metro during clean up exercises. Deduction = 6.
- 10) **Submission of Monthly Reports (maximum deduction is 5):** The service provider did not submit monthly reports. Deduction = 5.
- 11) **Service Coverage (maximum deduction is 10):** A greater percentage of households in the service zone did not receive service from the service provider. The service provider has registered less than 15% of beneficiaries within the service zones, creating avenues for junkies and other informal collectors to operate. Deduction = 4.
- 12) **General Cleanliness/Indiscriminate Dumping (maximum deduction is 15):** Indiscriminate dumping of refuse was rampant in the service with notable locations being the Zongo lane, Kojo Ababio Street, Mantse Agbonaa, Cadbury, London Market drain and many others. Deduction = 8.
- 13) **Capacity of Contractors Equipment holding (maximum deduction is 10):** The quantity of collection vehicles available was not adequate. Deductions = 3
- 14) **Health and Safety (maximum deduction is 10):** The company provided adequate PPE for waste collection crew. However, usage was not strictly enforced. Deduction made is 2

5.2.5 J. Stanley Owusu and Co Limited

- 1) **Innovation and Recycling (maximum deduction is 10):** During the period under review, no notable innovation was witnessed in the operations of the company. The company was required per the Franchise Agreement with the AMA to collect at least 12 tonnes of recyclable plastics separately by the end of the sixth year of the franchise ie. end of December, 2023, which the service provider has not been able to achieve. Deduction made under this criterion is 7.
- 2) **Collaboration with the WMD and MPH (maximum deduction is 10):** Some collaboration was witnessed in the area of enforcement and public cleansing. The service supported the Okaikoi South Sub Metro with logistics during clean up exercises. The company has officially engaged a group of informal collectors to improve coverage. Deductions made is 3.
- 3) **Submission of Monthly Reports (maximum deduction is 5):** The service provider does not submit monthly reports. Deduction made is 5.
- 4) **Service Coverage (maximum deduction is 10):** Collection services within the Okaikoi South Sub Metro was not complete during the period under review. Many households in communities such as Bubiashie Ayigbe Town, Bubiashie Presby Church area, Busanga Line, Kanaeshie No.1 & 2, Aenor and Neoplan Station are mostly serviced by informal waste collectors. Deduction made is 4.
- 5) **General Cleanliness/Indiscriminate Dumping (maximum deduction is 15):** As a result of the service provider not been able to cover up to 80% of the service zone and deploy credible strategies for specialize clientele such as traders, markets and transport terminals, the was constant indiscriminate disposal of refuse at locations such as the Dr. Busia Highway, Neoplan Station and its environs, Vodafon and Aenor . Deduction made is 5.
- 6) **Capacity of Contractors Equipment holding (maximum deduction is 10):** With the acquisition of more collection vehicles, the equipment holding of the company has improved. However, availability within the service zone was an issue. Deduction made is 3.
- 7) **Health and Safety (maximum deduction is 10):** The company provided PPE for waste collection. However, PPEs provided are adequate and usage was not strictly enforced. Deduction made is 2

5.3.1 REGISTRATION OF CLIENTS AND SUPPLY OF STORAGE BINS OCT – DECEMBER 2023

SUB METRO/CONTRACTOR	EST. POPULATION 2020	EST. HOUSEHOLDS 2020	TARGET (85%)	REG. HOUSEHOLDS	% OF REGISTERED HOUSEHOLDS	WEIGHT (15%)	BINS SUPPLIED	% OF HOUSEHOLDS SUPPLIED WITH BINS	WEIGHT (15%)	TOTAL SCORE (30%)
ZOOLION GH. ABLEKUMA SOUTH	125,182	33,833	28,758.03	2140	6.3	0.9	2110	6.2	0.9	1.8
KOBBI WASTE WASTE ABLEKUMA SOUTH	10834	2,928	2,488.89	1109	37	6.0	2372	81	12..2	18.2
MESKWORLD CO. LTD. ASHEIDU KETEKE 1	8,491	35,766	30,401.34	2143	6.0	0.9	1094	3.0	0.5	1.4
ASADU WASTE OKAI KOI SOUTH	142,472	35,962	30,401.34	1594	4.4	0.6	1540	4.3	0.6	1.2
J. STANLEY OWUSU & CO. LTD OKAIKOI SOUTH	152,421	37,934	32,243.85	16980	45	7.0	9241	24	4.0	11
	439,400	146,228								

5.3.2 PERFORMANCE OF SERVICE PROVIDERS

ACTUAL PERFORMANCE

ACTUAL PERFORMANCE

SN	CRITERIA	Maximum Points	ZOOLION Ablekuma South	KOBBY WASTE Ablekuma South	Meskworld Ash. Keteke	ASADU OKAI KOI SOUTH	JSO Okaikoi South	
1	Innovation and Recycling	10	2	2	5	2	3	
2	Collaboration with the WMD and MPH	10	5	5	7	4	7	
3	Submission of Monthly Reports	5	0	0	0	0	0	
4	Service Coverage	10	5	6	6	5	6	
5	General Cleanliness/ Indiscriminate Dumping	15	10	10	10	8	11	
6	Capacity of Contractors Equipment holding	10	8	6	7	7	8	
7	Health and Safety	10	8	8	8	8	8	
	Total Marks	70	38	37	43	34	41	

5.3.3 PERFORMANCE OF SERVICE PROVIDERS / EQUIPMENT HOLDING

NAME OF CONTRACTOR /SUB METRO	AVAILABLE						OPERATIONAL					
	NUMBER OF COMPACT ION TRUCKS	NUMBER OF SKIP TRUCKS	ROLL ON ROLL OFF TRUCKS	TIPPER TRUCKS	MOTOR KING / OTHERS	NUMBER OF COMPACT ION TRUCKS	NUMBER OF SKIP TRUCKS	ROLL ON ROLL OFF TRUCKS	TIPPER TRUCKS	MOTOR KING / OTHERS		
ZOOLION ABLEKUMA SOUTH	2	3	1	2	5	2	3	1	4	5		
KOBBY WASTE SERVICES / ABLEKUMA SOUTH	6	-	-	-	3	3	-	-	-	3		
MESKWORLD COMPANY LIMITED /ASHIEDU KETEKE	5	4	2	1	1	4	1	1	1	7		
ASADU OKAI KOI SOUTH	1	1	-	-	1	1	1	-	-	2		
J. STANLEY - OWUSU & CO. LTD / OKAI KOI SOUTH	8	3	3	17	3	5	3	1	15	3		
TOTAL	22	11	6	22	13	15	8	3	20	20		

5.3.2 PERFORMANCE APPRAISAL OF SOLID WASTE CONTRACTORS OCT –DECEMBER 2023

5.3.2 PERFORMANCE APPRAISAL OF SOLID WASTE CONTRACTORS OCT – DECEMBER 2023

S/NO.	SUB METRO/CONTRACTOR	REGISTERED HOUSEHOLDS	MARKS (15%)	BINS SUPPLIED	MARKS (15%)	TOTAL SCORE (30%)	MARKS (70%)	TOTAL MARKS (100%)	REMARKS
1	ZOOLION GH. ABLEKUMA SOUTH	2140	0.9	2110	0.9	1.8	38	39.8	Unsatisfactory performance.
2	ABLEKUMA SOUTH KOBBY WASTE	1109	6.0	2272	12.2	18.3	40	60.2	Unsatisfactory performance.
3	MESKWORLD CO. LTD. ASHEIDU KETEKE 1	2143	0.9	1094	0.5	1.4	43	44.4	Unsatisfactory performance.
4	ASADU OKAI KOI SOUTH	1594	0.6	1540	0.6	1.2	35	36.2	Unsatisfactory performance.
5	J. STANLEY OWUSU/KOBBY & CO. LTD	16980	7.0	9241	4.0	11	42	53.0	Unsatisfactory performance.

	OKAIKOI SOUTH								

6.0 OUTCOME OF PERFORMANCE EVALUATION – OCT 2023 TO DECEMBER 2023

None of the service providers secured average performance (Average performance between 65% - 75%)

Breakdown of their scores is as follows:

1) ZOMLION GH. ABLEKUMA SOUTH	----- 39.8
2) KOBBI WASTE / ABLEKUMA SOUTH	-----60.2
3) MESKWORLD LIMITED / ASHIEDU KETEKE	-----44.4
4) ASADU WASTE / OKAI KOI SOUTH	-----36.2
5) J. STANLEY OWUSU & CO. LTD / OKAIKOI SOUTH	-----53.0

6.0 RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendations are as follows;

- 1) The performance of service providers is poor and unreliable, most contactors do not adhere to targets set in the Franchise Agreement within their respective timelines eg. Targets for registration of households and separate collection of recyclables.
- 2) All service providers must be issued warning letters
 - a. To get involved in activities that promotes reduction and recycling of waste within their service zones
 - b. Increase their working interactions with the waste management department and metro public health department
 - c. Increase their service coverage as specified in the Franchise Agreement by December 2023
 - d. To submit detailed monthly reports by the fifteenth day of the following month
- 3) Sub Metros should be more involved in daily monitoring of operations of service providers in their respective jurisdiction

7.0 AMA/WMD CONCERNS

- i. Most operatives of services providers, especially operations staff do not have adequate knowledge on Franchise Agreement and obligations therein
- ii. Registration of households is not continuous in many service zones
- iii. Lack of strategy to service markets and other regulated premises in various service zones
- iv. Criss crossing and undercutting of service charges by some service providers
- v. Selective service to cooperate clients against households

8.0 CONCERNS OF THE SERVICE PROVIDERS

- i. Inadequate public education and sensitization by the AMA
- ii. High default rate in payment for service rendered resulting in poor cash flow
- iii. Difficulty in finding land space in the communities to put up facilities
- iv. Unwillingness on the part of some shop owner to pay for services being rendered
- v. Activities of junkies hindering our operations in the area

9.0 CONCLUSION

All the service providers are not up and doing in their respective service zones and there is the need to engage potential and willing service providers to take service delivery more seriously to deter contractors who take work for granted.